

List of Criteria for Reuse Decisions

Elbridge Gerry School Reuse Study
DRAFT FOR FINAL REVIEW AND COMMENT

April 1, 2019

This is a list of criteria that the Gerry School Re-use Committee recommends that the Town should employ to evaluate choices and make decisions regarding the reuse of the Gerry School. The criteria address:

- Building Reuse – the adaptive reuse of the building and its immediate surroundings, expected to include some parking, access and site improvements adjacent to the former school building.
- Site Reuse – criteria that includes that portion of the land that will be held by the municipality and used for park and playground uses, open space, and vehicular and pedestrian circulation.

The Committee has recognized that some criteria are more important than others. A weighting factor has been assigned each of the criteria, using a scale where a factor of 5 represents the highest level of importance, and where lower factors indicate relatively lower comparative importance.

This list reflects the input from participants at the community forum on the future of the Gerry School held on January 28, 2019. The list was then assembled through consultation and participation from the members of the Committee at its meetings on February 12 and March 12.

Building Reuse Criteria

Category	Criteria	Priority Factor
Architectural Design and Historic Preservation	The reuse restores and maintain the historic architectural character of the facades and roof	5
	Changes to the exterior envelope of the building are limited in number and locations and are consistent with the historic architectural character of the building	5
Parking and Circulation	Adequate provisions are made to provide for parking needs for all uses within the building without relying on any off-site locations for overnight parking or special events	5
	The parking access and layout are consistent with establishing and maintaining vehicle circulation and access to adjacent and nearby properties	5
Site Design	The design provides for an improved building perimeter including some landscaping and provides for enhanced main pedestrian entrances for the new uses.	3

Building Reuse Criteria (continued)

Category	Criteria	Priority Factor
Community Benefits	The reuse of the building provides direct civic benefits through functions and activities that attract and serve Marblehead residents.	2
	The reuse of the building provides direct civic benefits through on-site or offsite improvements or funding.	2
	The reuse of the building provides indirect community benefits through enhanced tax revenues.	4
Municipal Use	The need for any municipal use proposed for the Gerry School has been established and would be accommodated elsewhere, if the Gerry School were not available.	2
	Placing a municipal use in the Gerry School is more cost-effective relative to other potential locations for that same use on a net present value basis, considering both capital and operating cost.	2
Form of Disposition	The form of disposition of the Gerry School (lease or sale) should be based on market considerations and provide the best net present value to the Town.	4
Financial Factors	The future use should not result in a net burden on Town resources.	4
	The higher value proposition for the reuse of the existing building will be preferred if other factors are equal.	5
	More rapid redevelopment and reuse will be preferred in order to reduce the holding costs and risks to the Town.	4
	The preferred reuse proponent must be financially sound and capable of accomplishing and maintaining the reuse that it proposes.	5
	The new use will be a long-term occupant, and there is limited risk that the Town will be required to undertake a subsequent re-acquisition or disposition process.	4
Compatibility Factors	The reuse of the building will reduce general activity and traffic passing through the neighborhood relative to its former use as a public elementary school.	5
	The use will not impose nighttime activity or impacts that may be inconsistent with a residential neighborhood.	4
	The use will not result in daytime activities that are inconsistent with a residential neighborhood or interfere with the use and enjoyment of the adjacent park, playground, and pedestrian passage along the stairway that connects Elm Street and Mechanics Court.	4

Site Reuse Criteria

Category	Criteria	Priority Factor
Design	The landscape characteristics including the quality and character of plantings will be improved and maintained.	4
	Paved space for recreation will be retained and improved as an important element.	5
	Amenities such as seating areas and recreational equipment will be improved and maintained.	4
	The hill leading from the northside terrace into the park will be retained as public open space and improved.	3
	The park and playground areas have additional plantings to provide a more “green” appearance to balance the hardscaping and paved areas that are retained and used as play spaces and parking.	4
Parking and Circulation	Adequate provision will be made for clearly marked, designed and improved vehicle circulation within Mechanic Court and Mechanic Square which limits impacts on neighboring properties and maintains access to existing driveways and private parking on adjacent lots.	5
	Appropriate paved areas in the park will continue to be used in the customary manner by residents and institutions for temporary parking, while reducing potential safety conflicts with playground use.	4
	The public access paths, sidewalks, and stairs will be improved and maintained.	5
	Signage will be provided indicating the public ways and park space.	4
	To the extent possible, sidewalks and routes for pedestrians will be provided, separated from vehicular circulation.	4